



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

*Deutsches Liederbuch für amerikanische Studenten.* Texte und Melodien nebst erklärenden und biographischen Anmerkungen. Herausgegeben im Auftrage der Germanistischen Gesellschaft der Staats-Universität von Wisconsin. Boston, 1906. D. C. Heath & Co. Pp. 157.

This collection is the product of a happy combination of piety and independence on the part of the committee which prepared it, and it is sure to be hailed as a real boon by all friends of German song and of the German spirit. Wisely keeping in view the special needs of American students, the editors have expended an enormous amount of labor upon what might seem a comparatively simple task ; the work contains less than 100 songs. It was called forth by actual needs, and meets a real want. The labor was purely one of love, and its successful completion is a gratifying example of what can be accomplished by intelligent academic coöperation. Under the general editorship of Mr. Hohlfeld, a tentative list of songs was sent to professors of German and others interested in the subject, and this investigation served to make the collection a truly typical one, although the divergent answers were not weighed against one another by a merely mechanical process. The songs show unusual variety, including not only *Volks-* and *Studentenlieder*, but patriotic songs and even a few church hymns—as well as a considerable number of more elaborate and conscious compositions of the better sort musically. The arrangement of most of these as four-part songs makes the book more attractive, and gives better opportunity for æsthetic effect than can be obtained from the unvaried unison with which many German students content themselves. The new arrangements have been made in a thoroughly musical way by Mr. Elias F. Bredin. The settings are satisfactory, being neither unduly elaborate nor trivial ; a few songs are pitched somewhat too high. Brief notes are in no sense an intrusion, but serve in every case to shed helpful light where it is needed.

The matter of textual criticism, which forces itself upon any editor of songs, has been faced with fair adequacy. In choosing between variant readings, the adaptation of words to their melody or their general use are held to be more important, for this publica-

tion, than severe fidelity to a literary original. Perhaps it is here that the book is least satisfactory. If academic standards of scholarship mean anything, they stand for the conservation of purity as opposed to vulgarizing tendencies, which are a constant disintegrating force. We go back to the fountain head, and draw pure water. The rule of choosing between the myriads of debased readings on the subjective canon of greatest currency is bound to fail, for the tendency of such a principle is always to dispersion, and is as shifting as the sands. Admitting that the scrutiny of the text for a popular song-book is always a thankless task, it is nevertheless one which an academic body cannot waive, and one which a great American university is especially fitted to accept, first, because American scholarship has already contributed so much admirable and solid work in establishing sound texts of German authors, and secondly, because the very remoteness of the American institution from local or dialectic prejudices fits it eminently for exercising a judicial function. The editors have sought only 'trustworthy texts,' without wishing to enter the field of scientific text-criticism, but they have shown themselves better than their principles, for, in fact, they have bestowed much care on the text, and offer a number of strictly scientific notes in regard to variants. While vested rights may be conceded in the case of a song which has long been associated with the work of a great composer, we should protest heartily against the contamination of literature by unanointed tune-writers, singers, proof-readers, and type-setters. Minor musicians are far too prone to lay violent hands on such texts, apparently without any sense of the sacredness of the work of a master. *Omnibus est hoc vitium cantoribus.* We are sometimes told that this is done for reasons of phonetic euphony, but far more often it is due to an unauthorized intrusion into the field of literary criticism. The result is nearly always a reduction to tame stupidity, or a thoroughly cheap attempt at heightened rhetorical effect. Let such corruptions be never so current, they are unworthy of perpetuation. In his 'Select Hymns' John Wesley relates that he had tried for twenty years to get a small cheap collection of the tunes actually in use among Methodists, but masters of music were above following any direction but their own, 'and I was determined whoever compiled this should follow my direction, not *mending* our tunes, but *setting* them down, neither better nor worse

than they were,' and we may concede that he had a right to be judge in the matter.

Such unauthorized liberties are too frequent in the Madison book; for instance, in Luther's 'Ein' feste Burg' there is an unpleasant capricious alteration in the musical phrase 'Der alt' böse Feind,' the origin of which Heaven alone knows. It is certainly not derived from the best current collections of German chorals, nor yet from Sebastian Bach's masterly settings, nor from the normal 'heutige Choralform' given by Erk-Böhme. These all agree, and any 'amendment' against their combined authority is vicious.

The texts adopted by Felix Mendelssohn for his admirable settings were generally not quite standard, but one is less inclined to quarrel with their perpetuation, as they are wedded to the work of a master. In a few cases, however, an author has vested rights which even a great musician is bound to respect; for instance, in the final stanza of Eichendorff's 'Abschied' the reading 'in die Fremde' (for 'in der Fremde') is a *lectio facillior* of the most impertinent sort, and has not a leg to stand on. But why do the editors follow (in their second stanza of the same song) the variant 'der Menschen' (for 'des Menschen'), which is not according to Mendelssohn? A similar case occurs with Mendelssohn's composition of Feuchtersleben's 'Nach altdeutscher Weise' (here given the title 'Scheiden,' which does not belong to Mendelssohn's setting). One does not seriously object to the free treatment of the text by the composer, but one does deplore the gratuitous change from the original (in the third stanza) 'Und hältst du sie recht innig wert' into the trivial 'recht lieb und wert' (!) which impugns the poetic judgment both of Feuchtersleben and Mendelssohn. In stanza 2 on page 11 the correct reading 'im Dunkel' is simpler than 'im Dunkeln' and to be preferred, as also the good original title 'Brüderschaft' for the song on page 116. The arbitrary change of the title 'Soldatenliebe' to the less significant 'Treue Liebe' (p. 120) does not commend itself. On page 123 the original 'fiel' is better than 'fällt' in the first stanza. From Eichendorff's 'Der Jäger Abschied' the third stanza has been omitted without comment.

But it would be captious to dwell on such matters of detail in view of the fact that the editors have, in the main, shown far more

sense of responsibility than the great majority of German editors of songs. The volume they have given us is not merely a most attractive and serviceable one, but, in my opinion, the best for its purpose which exists anywhere. It will prove useful in many ways (even as a reader in the class-room), and I cordially echo, in closing, the expressed wish of the editors that it may help toward the much-desired goal of the development of a body of worthy songs in American colleges. There is nothing so transcendently final in the German student-songs as to make it impossible to equal or surpass them on American soil.

JAMES TAFT HATFIELD.

---

*Methodik des neusprachlichen Unterrichts*, von Dr. Oskar Thiergen, Professor am Königlichen Kadettenkorps zu Dresden. Mit 5 Abbildungen im Texte. Verlag von B. G. Teubner. 1903.

After the extreme statements made by the conservatives and reformers, it is refreshing to read a book which deals so sanely with the matter of language instruction, and yet betrays the spirit of true progress on every page.

Although the program which it outlines for the teachers of Saxony cannot be put into practice in America for the present at least, it contains hardly a paragraph which our teachers might not read with profit. This is true also of the more general questions of discipline, home study, and the aims of language instruction in classical, scientific and technical courses.

An unbiased discussion of the merits of the grammar, natural, and reform method precede the discussion of T.'s method, which appropriates the best and soundest features of its predecessors. In accordance with the most advanced thought on this question,<sup>1</sup> T. makes the living language the basis of class work although he explicitly states that the student cannot be expected to attain abso-

<sup>1</sup> Cf. Henry Sweet : *The Practical Study of Languages*. New York: Henry Holt & Co. 1900. T. Dawes : *Bilingual Teaching in Belgian Schools*. Cambridge. 1902.